

Distributive Normal form

Problem:

Show that for sets I and J and indexed collection of sets $\{S_{i,j} : i \in I, j \in J\}$, there exists a set J' and an indexed collection of sets $\{S_{i,j} : i \in I, j \in J'\}$ such that

$$\bigcap_{i \in I} \bigcup_{j \in J} S_{i,j} = \bigcup_{j \in J'} \bigcap_{i \in I} S_{i,j} = \bigcap_{i \in I} \bigcup_{j \in J'} S_{i,j}$$

Proof:

Set $J' = J^I$, the set of all functions from I to J and define $S_{i,f} = S_{i,f(i)}$ for each $f \in J^I$. We claim

$$\bigcap_{i \in I} \bigcup_{j \in J} S_{i,j} = \bigcup_{f \in J^I} \bigcap_{i \in I} S_{i,f} = \bigcap_{i \in I} \bigcup_{f \in J^I} S_{i,f}$$

The first equality is just the generalized distributive law. Now

if $x \in \bigcup_{f \in J^I} \bigcap_{i \in I} S_{i,f}$, then $\exists f_x$ such that $\forall i \ x \in S_{i,f_x}$. So $\forall i \ x \in \bigcup_{f \in J^I} S_{i,f}$. So $x \in \bigcap_{i \in I} \bigcup_{f \in J^I} S_{i,f}$

Conversely,

if $x \in \bigcap_{i \in I} \bigcup_{f \in J^I} S_{i,f}$, then $\forall i \ \exists f_{i,x}$ such that $x \in S_{i,f_{i,x}} = S_{i,f_{i,x}(i)}$.

Now define f by $f(i) = f_{i,x}(i)$.

$$x \in S_{i,f_{i,x}(i)}. \text{ So } x \in S_{i,f(i)} = S_{i,f}. \text{ So } \forall i \ x \in \bigcup_{f \in J^I} S_{i,f}.$$

Comments:

1. A similar theorem and construction works for $\bigcap_{i \in I} \bigcup_{j \in J_i} S_{i,j}$ for indexed sets J_i
2. If I and J are finite, a similar theorem holds in any Boolean algebra, in particular any first order logic (Note the concepts of Disjunctive (Conjunctive) Normal Form).
3. I first noticed this theorem while constructing a Craig interpolant in first order logic.